FARGO TAX EXEMPT REVIEW COMMITTEE Tuesday, August 25, 2020 – 1:00 p.m. City Commission Chambers, Fargo City Hall

AGENDA

- 1. Approve Tax Exempt Review Committee Meeting Minutes of 7/28/2020
 - a. July 28, 2020 minutes [Page 1-2]
- 2. New Industry Application by AdShark Ventures, LLC
 - a. Application for 5 Year Exemption [Page 3-9]
- 3. Application for PILOT for Beyond Shelter, Inc. (Milton Earl)
 - a. 20 year PILOT [Page 10-22]
- 4. Tax Exempt/PILOT Scoring System Discussion

TAX EXEMPT REVIEW COMMITTEE Fargo, North Dakota

Regular Meeting Tuesday, July 28, 2020

The July meeting of the Tax Exempt Review Committee of the City of Fargo, North Dakota was held in the City Commission Room at City Hall at 1:00 p.m., Tuesday, July 28, 2020.

The committee members present or absent are:

Present: Dave Piepkorn, Bruce Grubb, Jim Gilmour, Mike Splonskowski, Mayor Tim Mahoney, Jessica Ebeling,

Kent Costin, Robert Wilson, Jackie Gapp, Ryan Aasheim, Joseph Raso

Absent: Levi Bachmeier, Jim Buus, Erik Johnson, John Cosgriff

Commissioner Piepkorn called the meeting to order at 1:00 p.m.

A motion was made by Kent Costin to approve the minutes from the June meeting held on June 23, 2020. Jessica Ebeling seconded. Motion carried.

Application for PILOT for PRx Performance

Jim Gilmour explained that this was on the agenda last meeting, however they are expanding the previous plan that was presented. They are now looking at 170,000 square feet.

Bryan Brasch said they heard of a manufacturing plant that was closing down and they contacted them to see if they would be interested in working for PRx. They made an offer to the General Manager, who accepted the position, will bring 10 of his key employees. They will be brought on October 1. The new employees will work other jobs until the plant opens in about a year.

Ryan Aasheim presented analysis on some of the secondary impacts. Based on Implan, an economic modeling tool, out of the 99 jobs created by PRx, it will result in 57 indirect and induced jobs. The impact will be 156 jobs. Compensation will total \$2.6 million in payroll. Direct and induced annual sales in our region will be approximately \$17.9 million. The construction phase will add 87 jobs that will support 67 other direct and induced jobs throughout the community. Construction will have a direct impact of \$14.2 million and support \$7.7 million in indirect and induced sales and other sectors. The tax impact to the City of Fargo for one time construction will be \$55,000 in new tax revenue (i.e.: sales tax, property tax from employees purchasing homes), operations of PRx amount to \$36,000 each year, after 10 years of operating at full capacity the project will have generated nearly \$600,000 in tax revenue. Ryan will be emailing the additional information.

Kent Costin moved to approve the motion with Jackie Ebeling seconding. Motion Carried.

New Industry Aplication by AdShark Ventures, LLC

This will be moved to the next meeting due to a family health issue.

New Industry Application by Access Point Technologies EP Inc.

Jim Gilmour gave an update that the planned location wasn't working out.

Sean Carroll – Company President via phone shared that they are a medical device manufacturing company out of Rodgers, Minnesota that provides Map-IT catheters to the industry. They are doing development on a next generation product and the work that would be done in Fargo would be for the new system. APT will start by leasing a facility, they are currently looking at 4 spaces in Fargo. They will begin small but anticipate growing over the years. The plan includes 4 jobs in the first year, with pay of \$35+ an hour.

Jim Gilmour thought the higher pay would result in a higher score, however, because it is only 4 jobs and a weighted scale is used, they didn't score as high. The value of the space they would lease would be \$417,000 in value with a tax savings of \$5,700 a year over 5 years. The exemption will be less than \$30,000 for some very high paying jobs and a company that has tremendous potential for growth.

Mike Splonskowski explained that the weighted average was taken from the manual, taking salary points, using the weight for the number of jobs, jobs below ten people equal 20% of the 30 points.

It was decided that an interim meeting would be held with on-line participation if needed, once Access Point Technologies has found a space.

Report from the Greater Fargo-Moorhead EDC on economic activities and the Growth Initiative Fund

Joe Raso presented on how all economies work, EDC & Partners, Growth Initiative Fund Projects and economic impact to city and businesses.

Four Economic Inputs to the regional economy

- 1. Transfer Payments retirees, government
- 2. Tourism
- 3. Higher Education money
- 4. Primary Sector

What the EDC does: The goal is primary-sector job creation. They support recruitment, retention and expansion of the primary-sector companies. Primary-sector companies export a majority of their goods and services outside the trade area and bring new wealth into the region.

The EDC partners with Valley Prosperity Partnership, Fueling Our Future, Emerging Prairie and there are a number of others.

The Growth Initiative Fund was started back in the early 90's. Over the history 237 projects have been supported. They have a loan loss rate of only 1-2%. In 2019 they helped 29 different companies' complete projects in the region. This in turn directly or indirectly helped other companies in the area.

Since 2015 the EDC has received \$75,000 of investment from the City of Fargo. A conservative estimate of the taxes provided to the City because of the EDC assisted projects has been \$10.22 million. This is a return of \$136 for each \$1 invested.

Dave Piepkorn adjourned the meeting at 2:06 pm.

Application For Property Tax Incentives For New or Expanding Businesses

N.D.C.C. Chapter 40-57.1

Project Operator 's Application To City of Fargo
City or County

File with the City Auditor for a project located within a city; County Auditor for locations outside of city limits.

A representative of each affected school district and township is included as a non-voting member in the negotiations and deliberation of this application.

This application is a public record

1. Name of project operator of new or expanding business <u>AdShark Ventures, LLC</u>

Identification Of Project Operator

2.	Address of project5601 34 AVE S						
	City Fargo	County Cass					
3.	Mailing address of project operator503 7th St	N Ste 104					
	City Fargo	State <u>ND</u> Zip <u>58102</u>					
4.	Type of ownership of project ✓ Partnership □ Subchap □ Corporation □ Coopera	oter S corporation					
5.	Federal Identification No. or Social Security No	Don't have yet					
6.	North Dakota Sales and Use Tax Permit No. NA						
7.	If a corporation, specify the state and date of incorporation						
8.	3. Name and title of individual to contact Richard Berg						
	Mailing address 503 7th St N Ste. 104						
	City, State, ZipFargo, ND 58102	Phone No701-430-1983					
	t Operator's Application For Tax Incentives						
9.	Indicate the tax incentives applied for and terms	·					
	Property Tax Exemption	☐ Payments In Lieu of Taxes					
	5 Number of years	Beginning year Ending year					
	100 Percent of exemption	Amount of annual payments (attach schedule if payments will vary)					
10.	Which of the following would better describe the	project for which this application is being made:					
	☐ New business project	✓ Expansion of a existing business project					

11.	L egal description of project real property				
-	Two acres on the west side (bordering Veteran's Blvd)) of 5601 34 Ave S, Fargo, ND.			
	To be split from parcel 01-8519-00200-000				
12.	Will the project property be owned or leased by the pro	oject operator?			
	• • •	rentive granted accrue to the project operator? se or other agreement establishing the project operator's			
	benefits.				
13.	Will the project be located in a new structure or an exist	sting facility? 🗹 New construction 🗌 Existing facility			
	If existing facility, when was it constructed?				
	If new construction, complete the following:				
	a. Estimated date of commencement of construction	of the project covered by this application 9/1/2020			
	b. Description of project to be constructed including size, type and quality of construction 10,000 square feet of class "A" office space				
	c. Projected number of construction employees during	ng the project construction Unknown			
4.4					
14.	A pproximate date of commencement of this project's of	pperations _3/1/2021			
15.	E stimated market value of the property used <u>for</u> this project: 1,045,000	16. Estimate taxable valuation of the property eligible for exemption by multiplying the market values by 5 percent:			
	a. Land\$\$5,000_	a. Land (not eligible)			
	b. Existing buildings and structures for which an exemp-	b. Eligible existing buildings and structures\$			
	c. Newly constructed buildings and structures when completed\$ 2,000,000	c. Newly constructed buildings and structures when completed\$100,000			
	d. Total\$ 2,785,000	d. Total taxable valuation of property eligible for exemption (Add lines b and c)\$			
	e. Machinery and equipment\$	e. Enter the consolidated mill rate for the appropriate taxing district			
	Land Tax \$14,385	f. Annual amount of the tax exemption (Line d multiplied by line e)\$\$ 27,532.00			

		" means a ne tablished pa					xpansio	on port	tion of an	existing busine	ss. Do not
17.	Type of b	usiness to be	engage	din: 🗆	Ag pro Whole	ocessing esaling			□ Manufa □ Wareho		Retailing Services
18. E <u>Com</u>	be manu	factured, pro	duced,	assemble	d or sto	ored (atta	ch add	itional	sheets if ı	•	of any products to t, and conversion
rate op	otimization to	drive sales an	d new c	ustomer gro	wth for e	Commerc	e and lea	ad-base	d business	es. Plans to expan	d services into video
and cu	irrently work	ing on developi	ng an e0	Commerce	product f	eed mana	gement	SAAS. V	While most	of our services wo	uld be considered
under	the marketin	g umbrella our	unique	service offer	ings, da	ta-driven a	pproach	, and eC	Commerce	focus makes us va	stly different from
any otl	her compani	es in the Fargo	or even	North Dako	ota regio	ns. I consi	der our n	earest o	competitors	to be in Minneapo	lis or Duluth.
<u> </u>	Building w	he type of m ould be com et working s	prised (of mostly	office s	pace but	would	include		n, multiple conf	erence rooms,
-	· ·				<u> </u>						
20.	20. For the project only, indicate the projected annual revenue, expense, and net income (before tax) from either the new business or the expansion itself for each year of the requested exemption.										
	Year (12 m	mo. periods)	Proje	xpansion ct only ar 1	Pro	/Expansio ject only <u>Year 2</u>		ew/Exp Project <u>Year</u>	only	New/Expansion Project only Year 4	New/Expansior Project only <u>Year 5</u>
	Annual re	evenue	3000	000	350	0000	40	00000		4600000	5400000
	Annual ex	kpense	2650	000	310	0000	35	00000		400000	4600000
	Net incon	ne	3500	00	400	000	50	0000		600000	800000
21.	Projected	numberand s	alary of	persons t	o be er	mployed	by the	project	t foth e first	five years:	
		ions & positio									
	# Current Positions	New Pos Under S		New Pos \$13.01-\$		New Po: \$15.01-			Positions 1-\$28.00	New Positions \$28.01-\$35.00	New Positions Over \$35.00
	5	onder ,	713.00	\$15.01 \$	13.00	\$15.01	720.00	5	1 720.00	720.01 733.00	OVC1 \$33.00
	Year		(Before	project)	Ye	<u>ar 1</u>	<u>Year</u>	. 2	Year 3	Y <u>ear 4</u>	Year 5
	No. of Em	inlovees (1) 15	_	20		25		31	38	46
	NO. OI LIII	pioyees	2)								
	Estimated	d payroll (820,	000	1,080	0,000	1,350	.000_	1,668,00	2,039,000	2,463,000
	ull time art time	(2)								

22.	Is the project operator succeeding some	eone else in this or a similar business?	☐ Yes No
23.	Has the project operator conducted this	business at this or any other location eith	er in or outside of the state?
	☐ Yes ✓ No	,	
24.	Has the project operator or any officers o	f the project received any prior property to	ax incentives?□ Yes 🌠 No
	If the answer to 22, 23, or 24 is yes, give	details including locations, dates, and nan	ne of former business (attach
	additional sheets if necessary).		
Busine	ss Competition		
25.	Is any similar business being conducted by	by other operators in the municipality?	□ Y es 🗹 N o
	If YES, give name and location of compe	eting business or businesses	
	Percentage of Gross Revenue Received	Where Underlying Business Has ANY Loca	Il Competition %
Prope	ty Tax Liability Disclosure Statement		
26.	Does the project operator own real prope against it?	rty in North Dakota which has delinquent p No	roperty tax levied
27.	Does the project operator own a greate against any of its North Dakota real pro	r than 50% interest in a business that has operty? Yes No	delinquent property tax levied
	If the answer to 26 or 27 is Yes, list and e	xplain	
llse	Only When Reapplying		
28.		roperty tax incentives for the following rea	ason(s):
		nstances which were not presented at the	
		ent property tax incentives because the pr	,
		n	
	☐ had a change in project	operation or additional capital investmen	t of more than twenty percent
	☐ had a change in project	operators	
	 To request an additional annual exe entity and leased to the project ope 	mption for the year of on structure rator. (See N.D.C.C. § 40-57.1-04.1)	es owned by a governmental
Notic	e to Competitors of Hearing		
	•	nt to the governing body of the county or emunicipality has otherwise determined the	
ı, Ricl	nard Berg	, do hereby certify that the answers to th	e above questions and all of the
	· ·	iding attachments hereto, are true and co to the ownership or operation of the proje	rrect to the best of my knowledge
	Rick Burg	CEO	07 / 14 / 2020
	Signature	Title	Date



March 5, 2020

Rick Berg AdShark Marketing LLC 503 7th St. N, Ste. 104 Fargo, ND 58102

Dear Rick:

Thank you for your application for primary-sector certification by the North Dakota Department of Commerce, Economic Development & Finance Division. We have reviewed your application and determined that ED&F can certify your company, AdShark Marketing LLC, as primary sector and a new wealth creator in the economy of North Dakota. This certification is valid for four years from today's date (expires 3/5/2024).

Most of North Dakota's economic development programs, tools and incentives are targeted toward primary-sector clients. You may be requested to provide a copy of this primary-sector certification letter when you apply for certain economic development incentive and funding programs.

This certification does not guarantee the receipt of any North Dakota business incentive. For example, there are additional qualification criteria for the Seed Capital Investment and Agricultural Business Investment personal income tax credits and it is critical that investments NOT be made prior to the business receiving certification for these two credits. If you are pursuing certification for investment tax credits and need to know the criteria required for qualification, contact Joe Cicha 701-328-7283.

This certification is not the application process for the North Dakota New Jobs Training Program administered by Job Service North Dakota. To apply for the North Dakota New Jobs Training Program, you must contact Job Service North Dakota for the required application forms. Application forms for other programs that require primary sector certification are available from the agency administering the program.

Also, companies and individuals pursuing the investment tax credit incentive are reminded there is a cap on available dollars. Please visit with the ND Office of the Tax Commissioner regarding the remaining balance for investment tax credits. The credits are available on a first-come-first-serve basis until the law-defined cap is met.

North Dakota appreciates your contribution to the citizens and economy of our state. If there is anything further we can do to assist your company, please contact us at 701-328-5300.

Sincerely

James Leiman, Director

Economic Development & Finance Division

Exemption Evaluation Calculator 2020				
AdShark Ventures LLC		<u> </u>	Points	
Project Type Code (Ctrl-C to view)		9	38.0	
Current Number Of Employees		15		
Hourly Salary Without Benefits	# Jobs			
Under \$13.00		1		
\$13.01-\$15.00]		
\$15.01-\$20.00				
\$20.01-\$28.00	5	Pts. For # Jobs->	6.0	
\$28.01-\$35.00		Pts. For \$ Jobs->	6.0	
Over \$35.00				
TOTAL # OF JOBS CREATED	5			
% GI w/ Local Competition (not dow	ntown)	0%	25.0	
Value of Proposed Buildings	\$ 2,000,000	12.5		
Downtown Location (Y/N)	N	0.0		
Exemption Needed (Y/N)	N			
Startup Firm (Y/N)	N	0.0		
Has Const Started or Has Bldg Beer	า			
Occupied If Existing (Y/N)		N	0.0	
Number of Years (Exemption)		5		
Building Age (if substantial renovati	ion)	0	0.0	
RECOMMENDATION IS TO		DENY		
Description		Tech Research		
Estimated New Annual Payroll	\$249,600			
Estimated Annual Real Estate Tax		\$46,725		
Estimated PV of Exemption		\$202,295		
Payroll / PV of Exemption		1.2		
Property Value / # of Jobs		\$ 400,000		

^{**}FOR FIRST YEAR OF BUSINESS**

Exemption Evaluation Ca	lculator	2020	117.5
AdShark Ventures LLC		Ţ	Points
Project Type Code (Ctrl-C to view)		9	38.0
Current Number Of Employees		15	
Hourly Salary Without Benefits	# Jobs		
Under \$13.00			
\$13.01-\$15.00			
\$15.01-\$20.00			
\$20.01-\$28.00	31	Pts. For # Jobs->	30.0
\$28.01-\$35.00		Pts. For \$ Jobs->	12.0
Over \$35.00			
TOTAL # OF JOBS CREATED	31		
% GI w/ Local Competition (not dow	ntown)	0%	25.0
Value of Proposed Buildings		\$ 2,000,000	12.5
Downtown Location (Y/N)	N	0.0	
Exemption Needed (Y/N)	N		
Startup Firm (Y/N)	N	0.0	
Has Const Started or Has Bldg Beer	1		
Occupied If Existing (Y/N)	N	0.0	
Number of Years (Exemption)		5	
Building Age (if substantial renovati	ion)	0	0.0
RECOMMENDATION IS TO		APPROVE	
Description		Tech Research	
Estimated New Annual Payroll		\$1,547,520	
Estimated Annual Real Estate Tax		\$46,725	
Estimated PV of Exemption		\$202,295	
Payroll / PV of Exemption		7.6	
Property Value / # of Jobs		\$ 64,516	

^{**}PROJECTED JOBS FOR EXEMPTION TERM**

Application For Property Tax Incentives For New or Expanding Businesses

N.D.C.C. Chapter 40-57.1

Project Operator's Application To City of Fargo
City or County

File with the City Auditor for a project located within a city; County Auditor for locations outside of city limits.

A representative of each affected school district and township is included as a non-voting member in the negotiations and deliberation of this application.

This application is a public record

Identification Of Project Operator

	Address of project 708 4th Avenue	North	·			
	City Fargo			County Cass		
3.	Mailing address of project operator	PO Box 310				
	Ci	ty Fargo		State ND Zip 58107-0310		
4.	Type of ownership of project ☐ Partnership ☐ Corporation	☐ Subchapter S corp	oratio	on		
5.	Federal Identification No. or Social	Security No.				
6.	North Dakota Sales and Use Tax Permit No. NA					
7.	If a corporation, specify the state and date of incorporation North Dakota, May 1999					
8.	Name and title of individual to conf	act Dan Madler, CEO				
	Mailing address PO Box 310					
	City, State, Zip Fargo, ND 58107-03	10		Phone No. 701-551-0488		
ojec	et Operator's Application For Tax I		с.			
9.	Property Tax Exemption	1	V	Payments In Lieu of Taxes		
9.				Beginning year 2042 Ending year		
9.	Number of years	202				
9.	- ·		atta	Amount of annual payments (attach schedule if payments will vary)		
9.	Number of years	see	•	• •		

Description of Project Property

te in the County of Cass and the							
and Tanada							
Will the project property be owned or leased by the project operator? ☑ Owned ☐ Leased If the answer to 12 is leased, will the benefit of any incentive granted accrue to the project operator? ☐ Yes ☐ No If the property will be leased, attach a copy of the lease or other agreement establishing the project operator's benefits.							
. Will the project be located in a new structure or an existing facility? ✓ New construction ☐ Existing facility If existing facility, when was it constructed? If new construction, complete the following:							
ruction less, with ground floor community room, fitness s Coordinator office. Light							
dings and dings and uildings 500,000 d mill rate xing 292.44 e tax ultiplied							

Note: "project" means include any established	a newly establi i part of an exis	shed busing sting busing	ess or the exp ess.	ansion po	rtion of	an existing busi	ness. Do not
17. Type of business to	be engaged in:	□ Ag pr				facturing ousing	Retailing Services
. 18. Describe in detail to be manufactured, p	roduced, assem	oled or store	ed (attach addi	tional shee	ts if nec	essary).	
BSL will develop 42 un will be owed by a sepe	its of affordable i rate Limited Liab	ental housing	for seniors (5: Partnership wit	5±) to be co h BSI as the	nstructed e managir	in downtown Farg	co. The building
19. Indicate the type of	machinery and						
20. For the project only new business or the	20. For the project only, indicate the projected annual revenue, expense, and net income (before tax) from either the new business or the expansion itself for each year of the requested exemption.						
Year (12 mo. perioc	New/Expans Project onl Is) Year 1	y Pro	/Expansion ject only <u>Year 2</u>	New/Expa Project o <u>Year :</u>	nly	New/Expansion Project only <u>Year 4</u>	New/Expansion Project only Year 5
Annual revenue	See	Atr	ached	Proform	a		
Annual expense	· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·			 			
Net income		<u> </u>					
21. Projected number an	d salary of perso	ons to be em	ployed by the	project fo	r the firs	t five years:	
Current positions & pos							
		v Positions .01-\$15.00	New Position \$15.01-\$20.0		ositions -\$28.00	New Positions \$28.01-\$35.00	New Positions Over \$35.00
0				3			σ, σ, φου, σ
Year	(Before proje	ct) <u>Y</u> e	ar 1	ear 2	Year	3 Year 4	Year 5
No. of Employees	(1) 0					WATANIA MARKATANIA MAR	- Allender community
	(2) 0	3	3		3	3	3
Estimated payroll	(i) <u>0</u>			·			
(1) - full time (2) - part time	(2) 0	80,	000 82	,400	84,872	2 87,418	90,040

Previous	Business	Activity
----------	-----------------	----------

		WARRANTO PRODUCTIVA - IN - I	
22.	22. Is the project operator succeeding someone else in this or a similar business?	☐ Yes	⊘ No
23.			
	✓ Yes □ No		ine state.
24.	24. Has the project operator or any officers of the project received any prior property	tay incentives?	Yes □ No
	If the answer to 22, 23, or 24 is yes, give details including locations, dates, and n		
	additional sheets if necessary).	ame of former bus	ness (attach
	BSI or an affiliate of BSI, acting as a General Partner, has received PILOT's for t	he following affor	dabla baucina
	developoments: Graver Inn, Sisters Path, Bluestem Townhomes, Bluestem Hom	es, Sunrise North,	Cooper
Busine	usiness Competition		
25.	25. Is any similar business being conducted by other operators in the municipality?	✓ Yes	□No
	If YES, give name and location of competing business or businesses		
	There are currently 11 other LIHTC projects and 1 Housing Incentive Fund projects affordable rentals in Fargo. Note: BSI has develoed 8 of the 12 senior designate.		designated —
	Percentage of Gross Revenue Received Where Underlying Business Has ANY I	Local Competition	0/0
Prope	roperty Tax Liability Disclosure Statement		
26.	26. Does the project operator own real property in North Dakota which has delinque against it? ☐ Yes ☑ No	nt property tax levi	ed
27.	27. Does the project operator own a greater than 50% interest in a business that has a against any of its North Dakota real property? ☐ Yes ☑ No	delinquent property	tax levied
	If the answer to 26 or 27 is Yes, list and explain NA		
	Use Only When Reapplying		
28.	T J T T T T T T T T T T T T T T T T T T	97-070	1 1' .'
	 □ To present additional facts or circumstances which were not presented at the □ To request continuation of the present property tax incentives because the present property tax incentives the present property tax incentives		l application
	moved to a new location	oject nas.	
	had a change in project operation or additional capital investmen	nt of more than twe	ntv percent
	had a change in project operators		- (2 P
	☐ To request an additional annual exemption for the year of on structure entity and leased to the project operator. (See N.D.C.C. § 40-57.1-04.1)	res owned by a gov	ernmental
Notice	Notice to Competitors of Hearing		
Prior licatio	Prior to the hearing, the applicant must present to the governing body of the county or cation giving notice to competitors unless the municipality has otherwise determined the	city a copy of the a nere are no compet	ffidavit of pub- itors.
I. Dar	Daniel P. Madler , do hereby certify that the answers to	the above question	ns and all of the
inform	nformation contained in this application, including attachments hereto, are true and contained in this application, including attachments hereto, are true and contained that the answers to the ownership or operation of the project	rrect to the best of	my knowledge
	Chief Executive Officer		8-6-2120
	Signature Title		Date

PRIVACY ACT NOTIFICATION

In compliance with the Privacy Act of 1974, disclosure of a social security number or Federal Employer Identification Number (FEIN) on this form is required under N.D.C.C. §§ 40-57.1-03, 40-57.1-07, and 57-01-15, and will be used for tax reporting, identification, and administration of North Dakota tax laws. Disclosure is mandatory. Failure to provide the social security number or FEIN may delay or prevent the processing of this form.

Certification of Governing Body (To be completed by the Auditor of the City or County)						
The municipality shall, after granting any property tax incentives, certify the findings to the State Tax Commissioner and Director of Tax Equalization by submitting a copy of the project operator's application with the attachments. The governing body, on the day of, 20, granted the following:						
☐ Property Tax Exemption	☐ Payments in lieu of taxes					
Number of years	Beginning year Ending year					
Percent of exemption	Amount of annual payments (Attach schedule if payments will vary)					
	Auditor					

Notice To Competitors Of Hearing On Application For Property Tax Incentives

Notice is her	reby given that the	
		(City or county governing body)
of		. North Dakota, will meet at
	(City or county)	, North Dakota, will meet at(Time)
on(D	atat(Lo	to consider the application of
**************************************	(Projec	t operator name and address)
for property	tax relief on the project which	the applicant will use in the operation of
		(Type of business)
at		
		(Address)
		(Legal description)
Any competi	itor of that applicant may appea	ar and be heard by the(City or county governing body)
		(City or county governing body)
at the time a	nd place designated herein. A c	competitor may provide written comments to the governing
body before	the scheduled hearing.	
This notice is	s given by the above-named ap	oplicant pursuant to the provisions of North Dakota Century
Code § 40-5	57.1-03	

The Milton Earl affordable senior housing in downtown Fargo

Location:

Lots 4, 5, and 6, Block 10, Roberts 2nd Addition, Fargo, Cass County, North Dakota

	anticipated 2021 2022
Current assessed value	\$ 203,200 \$ 207,264 \$ 211,409 \$ 215,637
Estimated taxes	\$ 2,971 \$ 3,031 \$ 3,091 \$ 3,153

PILOT Request

Calendar		Estimated							
Year	Year	ı	PILOT	La	nd Tax		TOTAL		
2023	1	\$		\$	3,153	\$	3,153		
2024	2	\$	-	\$	3,216	\$	3,216		
2025	3	\$	-	\$	3,280	\$	3,280		
2026	4	\$	8,400	\$	3,346	\$	11,746		
2027	5	\$	8,568	\$	3,413	\$	11,981		
2028	6	\$	8,739	\$	3,481	\$	12,221		
2029	7	\$	8,914	\$	3,551	\$	12,465		
2030	8	\$	9,092	\$	3,622	\$	12,714		
2031	9	\$	9,274	\$	3,694	\$	12,969		
2032	10	\$	9,460	\$	3,768	\$	13,228		
2033	11	\$	9,649	\$	3,844	\$	13,493		
2034	12	\$	9,842	\$	3,920	\$	13,762		
2035	13	\$	10,039	\$	3,999	\$	14,038		
2036	14	\$	10,240	\$	4,079	\$	14,318		
2037	15	\$	10,444	\$	4,160	\$	14,605		
2038	16	\$	10,653	\$	4,244	\$	14,897		
2039	17	\$	10,866	\$	4,328	\$	15,195		
2040	18	\$	11,084	\$	4,415	\$	15,499		
2041	19	\$	11,305	\$	4,503	\$	15,809		
2042	20	\$	11,531	\$	4,593	\$	16,125		

-				
As	sui	ทท	tic	ms

First full year of operations	2023	
Year 1 - 3 PILOT	\$0	enables repayment of deferred developer fee from
		cash flow within 10 year window allowed by
Years 4 - 20	\$200 /unit	increasing annually by 2%

Both PILOT and land tax reflect 2% annual increase

The Milton Earl 708 4th Ave. N Fargo, ND 58103

DEVELOPIMENT COSTS	
ACQUISITION	184,710
SITE WORK	35,000
REHABILITATION & NEW CONSTRUCTION	8,396,237
PROFESSIONAL FEES	429,000
CONSTRUCTION INTERIM COSTS	269,413
PERMANENT FINANCING	35,000
SOFT COSTS	243,467
SYNDICATION COSTS	10,000
DEVELOPER FEES	1,250,000
PROJECT RESERVES	161,600
TOTAL	11,014,427

SOURCES OF FUNDS	
Investor Equity from LIHTC's	7,077,792
GP Equity	80/
Bank Loan	1,000,000
Soft Loan 1 - HOME CHDO	200,000
Soft Loan 2 - HTF	1,185,927
Soft Loan 3 - AHP	1,000,000
Soft Loan 4 - CDBG	0
Soft Loan 5 - Other	0
Soft Loan 6 - Other	0
Other	0
Deferred Loan	0
Deferred Developer Fee	250,000
TOTAL	11,014,427

												Rent	Rental Assumptions	Suc						
												Rent	Rent Increase / Yr		7%	Vaca	Vacaney Rate		×	
FOR THE PERIOD THROUGH												o B	Op Cost Increase /Yr	٦Ł	3%	Man	Management Fee		%	
	2023	2024	2025	2026	2027	2028	2029	2030	2031 2	2032 20	2033	2034	2035	2036 20	2037 2	2038	2038	70 UPUC	2044	SAUKS
	Year 1	Year 2	Year 3	Year 4	Year 5	Year 6	Year 7		Year 9 Ye	_										
SERRES																38				
+ Gross Potential Rent		372,671	380,125	381,725	395.482	403,391	411,459	419,688	428,082	436,644	445,377	454,284	463,370	472,637	482,090	491.732	501,586	511,588 E	521.830	532.285
+ Other Income	D	0	a	0	٥	D	0	a	0	0	P	0							-	
+ Interest income		145	145	<u>4</u>	345	145	145	145	45	45	45	145	345	145	45	£	145	ž.	. 15	, 1
- Residential Vacancies	(25,575)	(26,067)	(26,609)	(27,141)	(27,684)	(28,237)	(28,802)	(29,375)	(29,966)	(30,565)	(31,176)	(31,800)	_	(33.085)		_		-		(37,259)
Effective Gross Income	325,955	346.729	353,661	360.731	367.943	375,289	382.802	390.455	386.261	405 224	77.4.546	000	731 070	700 007	740 400	100				200
+ Operating Reserve Contribution												١.		1		ľ	400.007	100'03+	400,440	480,103
Revenue Available for Expenses	\$ 339,788.52	\$ 348,729.09 \$353,660.78 \$360,731,10 \$367	\$353,660.78 \$	360,731,10 \$	942.82	\$375,298.78 5382,801.86		\$390,455.00 \$388,261.21	1,261.21 \$408	\$406,223,54 \$414,5	345.11 \$422,	629.12 \$431,	078.20 5.438	\$414,345.11 \$422,629.12 \$431,078.20 \$438,897.48 \$448,428.54 \$457,455.41 \$466,601.62	188.54 \$457,	455.41 \$ 466,		\$475,930.76 \$485,445.48	45.48 5.495	5 495,152.51
Harman Committee of the																				
Administration	46 BERNESE STEELE S			Manufacturing No.		ACCEPTANCE CALL	Carlo Carlo Carlo		A PROPERTY.	200		STREET, STREET							9	
		26.635	00000	57.5%	4 8	50,000	130,442	34,350	38,38			151,218	•	-					185,979	191,559
Meintercence		2000	10000	200	8 8	0000100	8 6	42431	43.75	45,015	60,360	98/:/38	24. 28.		52,184	53,750	55,362		58,734	60,456
	23,300	gg t	8	58,242	8	67.F8	. S	65,562	67.519	69,544	<u>r</u>	25.78G	75,993		80,621	83,040	88.83		90,740	\$6,462
Sale action page	24,883	Zy ez	36,388	8	98 98	37,758	38,881	40,057	41,250	42,497	43,772	45,085	46,437	47,830	49,265	50,743	52,286	53,834	84,8	57.112
Reserves	14,700	15,141	15,595	16,063	16,545	17.041	17,553	18,079	18,622	19,180	19,756	20,348	20,869	21,587	22,235	22,902	23,589	24,297	25,026	25,777
Total Annual Operating Expenses	236,626	243,725	261,037	266,968	274,977	283,226	251,723	300,475	309,489	318,774 3	328,337 3	338,187	348,333	358,783 3	369,548	380,632	392,051	403,813 4	415,927	428,405
Adna	5,634																			
Net Annual Operating Income	103,152	103,004	102,624	93,763	92,966	92,072	91,079			87,450 8	86,008	84,442 8	82,746 8	80,915 71	78,942 7	76,823 7	74,550 7	72,118 6:	69,519 6	66,747
- 1st Mort Put. Date Coverage Halle	92,580	57,830 57,830 57,830 77, 828	57,830	57,830	57,830 1,84	57,830	57,830	57,830 883	57,830	57,830 ‡51	57,830	57,830	57,830	57,830	57,830	57,830	97,830 24,830	\$7 \$7	57,830	57,830
hand key shortfell up to line 16 above							[\$		9	4	Ė	ļ	1	i i		ĺ	1	Š	Y.
Cash Flow Available for Distribution DGR	45,332	45,174	44.794	35,933	35,136	34,242	33,249	32,150	30,942	29,620	28,178	26,612	24,916	23,085	21,112	18,393	16,720	14,288	11,889	8,917
- LP Asset Manager	5,000	5,150	5,305	5,464	5,628	5,796	5,970	6,149	6,334	6,524	6,720	6,921	7,129	7,343	7.563	7,790	8,024		8,512	8,768
- Deferred Dev Fee	40,332	40,024	39,489	30,469	39,508	28,446	27,279	26,001	24,608	13,784	0	0	•	0	0	0				
· Replenish Reserves			:								-		:							
	O	0	o	0	0	Þ	•	a	Ċ	6,524	6,720	6,922	7,129	7,343	7,563	7,790	8,024	0	0	o
ECHDO 1.20	9	0	o	ė	0	0	٥	٥	o	1,162	6,145	5,320	4,441	3,500	2,494	2,422	280	2,510	1,324	g
	0	ō	٥	ca Ca	0	o	a	o	o	1,162	6,141	5,320	144.4	3,500	2,494	1,422	88	2,510	1,324	8
Soft Loan 3 - AHP 1.00	D	В	a	0	0	0	0	o	Б	46	2,456	2,129	1,776	1,389	886	88	17	1,004	25	ĸ
Approx Coch Flow		6	6	•			,		,	•		,			,					
	•	•	3	>	.	5	5	3	>	5			6	0	0	0	0	0	6	¢
DCR short dain flow distributions	8,	091	100	8		1.00	901	00:1	100		904	20	007	1000		901				ů.
The state of the s			the state of the s		3"			t designation of the second	Section 1	Killian (See										

The Milton Earl RENT SCHEDULE / INCOME

			Income									Total
	Unit		Target	Number		Gross	Utility	Tenant		Monthly	Annual	Units
	Туре	SF	%	of Units	TBR	Rent	Allowance	Pd. Rent		Revenue	Revenue	Per Size
Efficiency								- \$	Ş	1	- \$	
Efficiency								₹	÷	,	- \$	Ī
Efficiency								\$	❖		\$	
Efficiency								\$	\$,	- \$	T
Efficiency								\$	\$	1	- \$	0
1 Bedroom	B	702.4	30	11	×	800	23		\$ 111	8,547	\$ 102,564	
1 Bedroom	A	712	30	2	×	800	23	\$ 7	\$ 111	1,554	\$ 18,648	
1 Bedroom	В	702.4	40	3	×	800	23	\$ 7	\$ 777	2,331	\$ 27,972	4 : 10 : 10 : 10 : 10 : 10 : 10 : 10 : 1
1 Bedroom	മ	702.4	05	3		691	23		\$ 899	2,004	\$ 24,048	
1 Bedroom	A	712	50	4		169	23		\$ 899	2,672	\$ 32,064	
1 Bedroom	В	702.4	09	13		691	23	\$ 60	\$ 899	8,684	\$ 104,208	36
2 Bedroom	В	628	08		Х	1060	32	\$ 1,028	\$ \$	1,028	\$ 12,336	
2 Bedroom	A	862	30	\mathbb{T}		202	32		475 \$	475	\$ 5,700	
2 Bedroom	മ	839	20			208	32	\$ 77	775 \$	775	\$ 9,300	
2 Bedroom	А	862	. 20	2		208	32		775 \$	1,550	\$ 18,600	
2 Bedroom	В	839	09	T		658	32	\$ 82	827 \$	827	\$ 9,924	9
3 Bedroom								- ئ	❖	•	, \$	
3 Bedroom								- \$	\$	-	- \$	
3 Bedroom								- \$	\$	-	- \$	
3 Bedroom					.a.:: .i:- .			- \$	\$	1	- \$	
3 Bedroom								- \$	\$	-	- \$	0
4 Bedroom								- \$	\$	-	- \$	
4 Bedroom								- \$	\$	-	- \$	
4 Bedroom								- \$	\$	1	- \$	
4 Bedroom								- \$	\$	ţ	- \$	
4 Bedroom								- \$	\$		- \$	0
GROSS RENTAL INCOME	NCOME			45					\$	30,447	\$ 365,364	42

The Milton Earl affordable senior housing in downtown Fargo

Location:

Lots 4, 5, and 6, Block 10, Roberts 2nd Addition, Fargo, Cass County, North Dakota

		а	nticipated		
	2019		2020	2021	2022
Current assessed value	\$ 203,200	\$	207,264	\$ 211,409	\$ 215,637
Estimated taxes	\$ 2,971	\$	3,031	\$ 3,091	\$ 3,153

PILOT Request

Calendar		Re	quested	Est	timated		f	ull taxes	ND State
Year	Year		PILOT	La	and Tax	TOTAL			PILOT
2023	1	\$	-	\$	3,153	\$ 3,153	\$	146,220	\$ 16,543
2024	2	\$	-	\$	3,216	\$ 3,216	\$	149,144	\$ 16,874
2025	3	\$	-	\$	3,280	\$ 3,280	\$	152,127	\$ 17,211
2026	4	\$	8,400	\$	3,346	\$ 11,746	\$	155,170	\$ 17,556
2027	5	\$	8,568	\$	3,413	\$ 11,981	\$	158,273	\$ 17,907
2028	6	\$	8,739	\$	3,481	\$ 12,221	\$	161,439	\$ 18,265
2029	7	\$	8,914	\$	3,551	\$ 12,465	\$	164,667	\$ 18,630
2030	8	\$	9,092	\$	3,622	\$ 12,714	\$	167,961	\$ 19,003
2031	9	\$	9,274	\$	3,694	\$ 12,969	\$	171,320	\$ 19,383
2032	10	\$	9,460	\$	3,768	\$ 13,228	\$	174,746	\$ 19,770
2033	11	\$	9,649	\$	3,844	\$ 13,493	\$	178,241	\$ 20,166
2034	12	\$	9,842	\$	3,920	\$ 13,762	\$	181,806	\$ 20,569
2035	13	\$	10,039	\$	3,999	\$ 14,038	\$	185,442	\$ 20,981
2036	14	\$	10,240	\$	4,079	\$ 14,318	\$	189,151	\$ 21,400
2037	15	\$	10,444	\$	4,160	\$ 14,605	\$	192,934	\$ 21,828
2038	16	\$	10,653	\$	4,244	\$ 14,897	\$	196,793	\$ 22,265
2039	17	\$	10,866	\$	4,328	\$ 15,195	\$	200,729	\$ 22,710
2040	18	\$	11,084	\$	4,415	\$ 15,499	\$	204,743	\$ 23,164
2041	19	\$	11,305	\$	4,503	\$ 15,809	\$	208,838	\$ 23,627
2042	20	\$	11,531	\$	4,593	\$ 16,125	\$	213,015	\$ 24,100

Assumptions

First full year of operations	2023	
Year 1 - 3 PILOT	\$0	enables repayment of deferred developer fee from
		cash flow within 10 year window allowed by
Years 4 - 20	\$200 /unit	increasing annually by 2%

Both PILOT and land tax reflect 2% annual increase

Currently assessed land value			
314 the St N	\$	70,000	
320 7th St N	\$	70,000	
324 7th St N	\$	27,000	
712 4th Ave N	\$	22,000	
708 4th Ave N	\$	14,200	
Total	\$	203,200	

taxable value \$ 10,160 5% estimated land taxes \$ 2,971.19 0.29244

Value of building at completion
\$ 10,000,000
\$ 500,000 taxable value
\$ 146,220 estimated land taxes

ND State PILOT

\$16,543 5% gross rents collected less utilities

Memorandum

To: City of Fargo

From: PFM Financial Advisors LLC

Re: The Milton Earl Analysis

Beyond Shelter, Inc. ("Developer") is working to develop The Milton Earl which will be an affordable senior living facility consisting of 42 units to serve lower income households. Total cost is estimated to be approximately \$11.014 million.

PFM reviewed and replicated the projected cash flows of The Milton Earl as provided by the Developer. PFM found the assumptions used in the pro forma cash flow to be reasonable. In order to finance the project, the Developer invested equity in the form of Low-Income Housing Tax Credits (LIHTC) which they were able to leverage into approximately \$7,077,792 of tax credit equity, in addition to \$708,000 in general partner equity. The Developer also plans to receive soft loans from the HOME Community Housing Development Organization, Housing Trust Fund, and Affordable Housing Program totaling \$2,685,927 which will be repaid from net revenues of the project. The Developer plans to take out a permanent mortgage loan to fund the last funds needed in the amount of \$1,000,000; and utilize \$250,000 in deferred developer fees. The Milton Earl must have a minimum of 1.20x coverage on the permanent loan per the lender which is a reasonable coverage level for this type and size of project.

PFM ran three analyses:

- 1.) Full taxes paid only on the land and building value (\$10,215,637);
- 2.) Full taxes paid on land value (\$215,637) with requested PILOT; and
- 3.) Full taxes paid on land value plus North Dakota State PILOT.

PFM found that the project will be feasible under Scenarios 2 and 3. The project is not feasible under Scenario 1.

<u>Scenario</u>	Minimum Coverage in First <u>10 Years</u>	1.20x Coverage <u>Achieved</u>
Scenario 1	-0.98x	N/A
Scenario 2	1.68x	Year 1
Scenario 3	1.44x	Year 1