

HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION Tuesday, July 15, 2025 | 8:00AM City Commission Chambers AGENDA

- 1. Approval of Minutes May 20, 2025
- 2. Historic Overlay District Review
 - a. 1115 6th Street South Erskine's Historic Overlay (Hawthorne Neighborhood)
- 3. Adjourn Next Meeting: August 19, 2025

Historic Preservation Commission meetings are broadcast live on cable channel TV Fargo 56 and can be seen live by video stream on <u>www.FargoND.gov/streaming</u>. They are rebroadcast each Thursday at 8:00 a.m., Friday at 3:00 p.m. and Saturday at 3:00 p.m. Minutes are available on the City of Fargo Web site at <u>www.FargoND.gov/historicpreservationcommission</u>.

People with disabilities who plan to attend the meeting and need special accommodations should contact the Planning Office at 701.241.1474. Please contact us at least 48 hours before the meeting to give our staff adequate time to make arrangements.

BOARD OF HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSIONERS MINUTES

Regular Meeting:

Tuesday, May 20, 2025

The Regular Meeting of the Board of Historic Preservation Commissioners of the City of Fargo, North Dakota, was held in the Commission Chambers at City Hall at 8:00 a.m., Tuesday, May 20, 2025.

The Historic Preservation Commissioners present or absent were as follows:

Present: Heather Fischer, Mike Dawson, Nathan Larson, Nicole Holden

Absent: Christine Kloubec, Matthew Boreen

Chair Fischer called the meeting to order and welcomed Members to the meeting.

Item 1: Minutes: Regular Meeting of April 15, 2025

Member Dawson moved the minutes of the April 15, 2025 Historic Preservation Commission meeting be approved. Second by Member Larson. All Members present voted aye and the motion was declared carried.

Item 2: Historic Overlay District Review

a. 26 South Terrace North – Oak Grove Historic Overlay (Horace Mann Neighborhood)

Planner Luke Morman presented the application to demolish an existing accessory structure and to construct a new accessory structure.

Applicant Jacob Radke spoke on behalf of the application.

Discussion was held on the roof pitch, materials, location of the new structure, and color scheme.

Member Larson moved to approve the application as presented. Second by Member Holden. All Members present voted aye and the motion was declared carried.

Item 3: Updates from Staff

Planning Coordinator Maegin Elshaug noted the Land Development Code consultants will be in Fargo in June for meetings.

Item 4: Adjourn: Next Meeting – June 17, 2025

The time at adjournment was 8:08 a.m.

<u>MEMORANDUM</u>

TO:	Historic Preservation Commission
FROM:	Luke Morman, Planner
DATE:	July 10, 2025
RE:	1115 6 th Street South – Demolition and Addition within Erskine's Historic Overlay District

The Planning Department has received an application from Kevin Johnk to demolish the existing porch and construct a new front porch at 1115 6th Street South. The property is located within the Erskine's Historic Overlay District (Ordinance 4821). Applicable Special Development Standards include subsection F.1 – Additions for principal building and subsection H – Demolition. The original house built in 1910 is a Victorian style.

Attached to this packet are images of the existing porch, a structural report, and drawings and renderings of the proposed porch addition. The applicant proposes removing the existing porch and building the new porch addition in the front of the property. The addition will match the size of the existing porch and provide "LP SmartSide Pebbled Stucco Panel Siding" with trim on the addition to visually match the original structure based on a historic photo, rather than the stucco that is there today. Subsection F.1.a states, "The use of substitute materials is permissible if matching the existing material is not technically or economically feasible." A structural report was provided by an Engineer to describe the current condition of the porch. City staff does not have any records of when the structure changed from lap siding to stucco.

The Core Neighborhoods Plan identifies the subject property, located within the Hawthorne Neighborhood, as suitable for single-family residential use.



APPLICATION FOR CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS

No building permits for new construction or for alterations to the exterior of existing structures shall be issued for property within a Historic Overlay district until a Certificate of Appropriateness has been reviewed and approved in accordance with the procedures with Section 20-0912. A Certificate of Appropriateness may be reviewed and issued by The Historic Preservation Commission and or City Staff, depending on the type of project and the Historic Overlay district.

The Historic Preservation Commission meets monthly at 8:00 am on the third Tuesday of the month, in the City Commission Room, City Hall, 225 4th Street North. Applicants must be present at the meeting. More information on design standards is available at: www.FargoND.gov/historicpreservation.

The following must accompany this application:

- a. Photos of the existing site
- b. Plans of the proposed project
- c. Building materials
- d. Site plan if applicable

Property Owner Information

Name (printed):

Name (printed):

Address:

Contact Person Information (if different than owner)

Name (printed):

Address:

Parcel Information

Historic overlay district of subject property :

Address:

Legal Description (attach separate sheet if more space is needed):

Check each of the following which applies to your p	project
 Exterior remodel Window replacement New dormer New/replacement chimney Skylight Overhead garage door replacement Other: 	 New garage New accessory structure (not garage) New porch Front yard paving Demolition New addition

Briefly Describe The Proposed Scope of Work	

Acknowledgement – We hereb preparation of this submittal and				
Owner (Signature):	Vince Lindgren	Date:	6/25/25	
Representative (Signature):	Kevin Johnk	Date:	6/25/25	

ORDINANCE NO. 4821

partial replacement of non-original exterior cladding shall be exempt from this regulation.

b. Windows and Doors

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

23

- 1. Windows and doors shall match the original principal building in design and operation. The use of substitute materials is permissible if matching the existing material is not technically or economically feasible.
- 2. If the principal building is void of its original windows or doors, replacement windows and doors shall be of a design compatible with the historic style of structures located within the district. The use of substitute materials is permissible if matching the existing material is not technically or economically feasible.
- 3. Window or door openings shall not be increased or decreased by more than 10% in dimension or total area. Any changes in dimension or area will require review by the Fargo Historic Preservation Commission.
- c. Roofs
 - 1. Roof functional and decorative features, such as roofing materials, cresting, dormers, chimneys, cupolas, vents, and gutters shall match the original in design, dimension, detail, texture, and pattern. The use of substitute materials is permissible if matching the existing material is not technically or economically feasible.
 - 2. Skylights are prohibited on all roof planes parallel to and facing the street.

2. Accessory Buildings or Structures

a. Alterations to accessory buildings and structures shall be compatible with the style of the principal building, and shall be subordinate to the principal building.

F. Special Development Standards - Additions

In conjunction with Section 20-0912.C(2) of the Fargo Land Development Code, the Historic Preservation Commission shall consider the following criteria in review of a request for a Certificate of Appropriateness regarding an addition to a principal building,

ORDINANCE NO. 4821

accessory building or structure. A request that satisfies all of the following criteria shall be approved.

1. Principal Building

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

23

- a. Exterior Cladding
 - 1. Exterior cladding of the addition shall match the original principal building in design, dimension, detail, texture, and pattern. The use of substitute materials permissible if matching the existing material is not technically or economically feasible.
 - 2. If the principal building is void of its original exterior cladding, the cladding of the addition shall match the existing cladding of the principal structure. The use of substitute materials is permissible if matching the existing material is not technically or economically feasible.
- b. Windows and Doors
 - 1. Windows and doors of the addition shall match the original principal building in style, design and operation. The use of substitute materials is permissible if the original material is not technically or economically feasible.
 - 2. If the principal building is void of its original windows or doors, the window and doors of the addition shall match the existing principal building. The use of substitute materials is permissible if the existing material is not technically or economically feasible
 - 3. A garage door of an attached, front-yard entered garage addition shall not exceed 10 feet in width or 8 feet in height. A double-stall garage will require 2 doors.

c. Roofs and Dormers

- 1. The roof form of an addition to the principal building shall be consistent with the roof style and pitch of the principal building.
- 2. Flat roofs and shed roofs are prohibited, except on porches and where consistent with the roof form of the original principal building.

ORDINANCE NO. 4821

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

23

- 3. All gable roofs shall have a minimum pitch of 6:12. All hip roofs must have a minimum pitch of 3:12.
- 4. The reconstruction or addition of dormers to an existing principal building, or the addition of dormers to an addition to a principal building shall be consistent with the style of an HNS.
- 5. Roof functional and decorative features, such as roofing materials, cresting, dormers, chimneys, cupolas, vents, and gutters shall match the original principal building in design, dimension, detail, texture, and pattern. The use of substitute materials is permissible if matching the existing material is not technically or economically feasible.
- 6. If the roof of the principal building is void of its original functional and decorative features, the roof of the addition shall match the existing roof of the principal structure. The use of substitute materials is permissible if matching the existing material is not technically or economically feasible.
- 7. Skylights are prohibited on all roofs parallel to and facing the street.

d. Entrances, Porches, and Decks

- 1. A new front entrance addition to the principal building shall face the street.
- 2. A new front entrance addition to the principal building shall have no fewer than four steps, or an equivalent ramp distance, from the ground level to the bottom of the front entrance door, or shall have the first floor plane in a style compatible with an HNS.
- 3. Reconstruction of an open or screened porch (not an enclosed porch which provides year-round living space) which was historically a part of the original principal building shall be allowed to be rebuilt, and as may be necessary to accurately reconstruct, shall be allowed to vary by right from any existing zone district setback standards of the Fargo Land Development Code. The burden of establishing that a porch was part of the original structure is the owner's burden, not the City's.

ORDINANCE NO. 4821

- 4. Decks are prohibited in front yards.
- 5. On corner lots, decks are allowed on street side yards with screening, either by fence or landscaping.
- e. Height and Elevation
 - 1. The height of a new addition to a principal building shall not exceed the overall scale of an HNS with a maximum eave height of 25 feet.
 - 2. The height of a new addition to the principal building shall not be greater than the height of the principal building, except in the case of a second story addition to a single story principal building, the result of which is the creation of a two-story principal building consistent with an HNS.

2. Accessory Buildings or Structures

- a. Additions to existing accessory buildings or structures shall be subordinate in scale and compatible with the design and style of the principal structure.
- b. An addition to an existing accessory building that does not meet the dimensional setback standards of the LDC and does not increase in total floor area of the existing accessory building by more than 40%, is permissible by right, provided that: 1) the existing non-conforming setback is not increased; 2) the property line from which the non-conforming setback is determined is verified by a registered land surveyor; and 3) the new accessory building addition is limited in height to no more than one-story with 10-foot maximum sidewalls.

G. Special Development Standards - New Construction

In conjunction with Section 20-0912.C(2) of the Fargo Land Development Code, the Historic Preservation Commission shall consider the following criteria in review of a request for a Certificate of Appropriateness regarding the new construction of a principal building, accessory building or structure. A request that satisfies all of the following criteria shall be approved.

ORDINANCE NO. 4821

right, provided that: 1) the existing non-conforming setback is not increased; 2) the property line from which the setback is determined is verified by a registered land surveyor; and 3) the new accessory building is limited in height to no more than one-story with 10-foot maximum sidewalls.

H. Special Development Standards - Demolition

In conjunction with Section 20-0912.C(2) of the Fargo Land Development Code, the Historic Preservation Commission shall consider the following criteria in review of a request for a Certificate of Appropriateness regarding the demolition of a principal building, accessory building or structure. A request that satisfies all of the following criteria shall be approved.

- 1. The requested demolition is justified by the state of deterioration, disrepair and structural stability of the structure, or the building has been condemned.
- 2. The requested demolition is not detrimental to the overall style of the historic district.
- 3. The requested demolition is consistent with the purpose of the Comprehensive Plan and other adopted policies of the City.

I. Variance of Special Development Standards

To allow for a variance of hardships that may arise from the strict application of any of the foregoing Special Development Standards, the Historic Preservation Commission may consider requests to deviate from any applicable standards and allow for an exceptions. A vote of two-thirds of all the members of the Historic Preservation Commission is required for approval of any exception to the Special Development Standards.

<u>Section 2</u>. The City Auditor is hereby directed to amend the zoning map now on file in his office so as to conform with and carry out the provisions of this ordinance.





2021 Google Street View:



Site Photos from applicant:











Structural Report:



Owner: Vincent Lindgren Project: Porch Settlement Project address: 1115 6th St S. Fargo, ND, 58103

I hereby certify that the following report has been prepared by Carl Entzie.



House at 1115 6th Street S., Fargo, N.D.







The owner of the property located at 1115 6th St S is planning to undertake a project to remove and replace the front porch due to issues related to settling over time. The owner of this home, which dates back to 1910, has photographs showcasing the building in its original state. These images reveal that the structure was originally built using what appears to be timber siding, which contrasts with its current appearance, featuring stucco on both the interior and exterior of the porch. The owner aims to restore the porch to more closely reflect its historical aesthetic while also addressing safety and structural concerns resulting from the settling.

Considering the timber siding construction observed in the photographs provided by the homeowner, the original weight of the porch is estimated to be around 5 pounds per square foot. This estimate reflects the lighter materials typically used in timber structures. Furthermore, the subsequent installation of the stucco siding has significantly increased the weight of the porch, adding an estimated additional 15 pounds per square foot.

The stucco exterior of the home is exhibiting significant signs of deterioration in several areas. Notably, there are extensive cracks ranging from half an inch to as much as 2 inches in width, particularly at the junction where the porch meets the main structure of the house. These cracks are indicative of potential underlying issues, such as structural movement or moisture infiltration.











The large screen frames located on the northern and southern sides of the porch have become disengaged from the main frame at opposite corners. This detachment is a result of a noticeable crack that extends diagonally across the porch starting from the base of the house and moves toward the front exterior wall of the porch. The crack appears to follow a line of weakness in the structure, causing the screens to pull away from their intended positions.



The settlement the porch has experienced in the area has led to the emergence of cracks in the stucco finish. The inherent properties of stucco, combined with the nature of its construction, make it susceptible to such damage. As these cracks develop, they are likely to propagate, further compromising the integrity of the exterior finishes.

In Fargo, ND, the situation is exacerbated by the region's climatic conditions, including significant moisture penetration and the freeze-thaw cycles that are typical during the winter months. When water seeps into the cracks, it can freeze and expand during colder temperatures, leading to further deterioration of the stucco. Each cycle weakens the material, increasing the likelihood of additional structural failures within the original framework of the homes. If left unaddressed, these issues could result in more costly repairs and a significant impact on the overall durability and safety of the structures.

During the inspection, immediate access to the basement foundation wall at the front of the house was restricted due to the existing interior finishes. Despite this limitation, a thorough visual examination did not reveal any signs of bowing or deformation in the visible areas of the foundation. Furthermore, upon



inspection of the remaining foundation walls, no cracks were observed that would raise structural concerns on the house; all were found to be stable and in good condition.

Additionally, the windows located on the main floor of the home were inspected, and no cracking was observed radiating from the corners of the frames. This lack of cracking is a positive indication, suggesting that there has not been any significant differential settlement affecting the structure of the home. Overall, the foundation of the house is sound, with no immediate issues detected at this time.

It is anticipated that the increased weight of the porch, resulting from the application of stucco, has been exerting additional stress on a foundation whose type and dimensions remain unknown. Over the years, this added weight contributed to a gradual settling of the porch. Recently, however, the owner has noticed signs of accelerated movement, indicating that the settling process may be progressing more rapidly than before. This could lead to structural and aesthetic concerns if not addressed.



Appendix – Additional Photos



Typical Exterior Cracking:

















Typical Interior Wall Cracking:











Interior Floor slope:









Elevation Drawing (Side Profile)



Elevation Drawing (Front Profile)



The proposed siding materials we will be using for the finished product include: (We are going for a board and batten look).

1. LP SmartSide Pebbled Stucco Panel Siding

2. LP SmartSide Trim

for easier us		pplications an			are-edge design otection against	
AVAILABLE P	ROFILES					
Pebbled Stucco Panel Siding	Cedar Texture Groove Panel Siding	Cedar Texture No-Groove Panel Siding	Cedar Texture Vertical Siding	Brushed Smooth Vertical Siding	See It In Action	
FIND A CO	NTRACTOR >	EXPERTFI				







7/8/2025 5:20:04

